
**THE EFFECT OF SERVICE QUALITY ON UMRAH PILGRIMAGE LOYALTY WITH
PILGRIMAGE SATISFACTION AS A MEDIATION VARIABLE ON UMRAH
TRAVEL IN BANDA ACEH: A CASE STUDY OF KAIFA TOURISM COMPANY**

Muda Mubarak, Mukhlis, Mahdani*

Management Department, Universitas Syiah Kuala, Indonesia

<http://doi.org/10.35409/IJBMER.2024.3594>

ABSTRACT

This study aims to investigate the impact of Service Quality (Servqual) on Umrah Pilgrimage Loyalty, with Pilgrimage Satisfaction as a mediating variable in Umrah Travel in Banda Aceh, focusing on Kaifa Tourism company. The target population for this research was all Umrah pilgrims traveling with Kaifa Tourism company in Banda Aceh, and the sample size was 150 people. Data analysis was conducted using Partial Least Square (PLS) methodology. The findings indicate that Servqual significantly influences Pilgrimage Satisfaction, Servqual significantly influences Pilgrimage Loyalty, Pilgrimage Satisfaction significantly influences Pilgrimage Loyalty, and Pilgrimage Satisfaction significantly mediates the Servqual impact on Pilgrimage Loyalty. Satisfaction with the findings is proven to function as a partial mediator. These findings explain the model of increasing Pilgrimage Loyalty is a function of increasing Servqual in Pilgrimage and Pilgrimage Satisfaction. These results strengthen the theory of causality in its relationship with the current Umrah Pilgrimage.

Keywords: Service Quality, Satisfaction, Loyalty.

1. INTRODUCTION

The Umrah pilgrimage has the meaning and intention of going to the city of Makkah to carry out worship (such as Tawaf and Sa'i) by carrying out certain procedures or other terms, coming to the Baitullah to perform the Umrah prayer with the pillars and conditions that have been determined. The Umrah pilgrimage is different from the Hajj pilgrimage which can only be performed once, performing the Umrah pilgrimage may be done repeatedly, however, the law is still obligatory only once in a lifetime. If someone is capable and can perform it repeatedly, this Umrah is permitted, also called Hajjul Asghar (small Hajj) (Arifin, 2009). The Umrah pilgrimage can be performed anytime, except on holy days such as Arafah, Nahar, and Tasyriq. The Umrah pilgrimage can be carried out directly at the same time as the Hajj pilgrimage, namely by performing Hajj Tamattu or Qiran. This is because the Umrah pilgrimage is not time bound, the time can be adjusted to work schedules or school holidays or by taking advantage of certain moments, such as during the holy month of Ramadan, etc. Indonesia is known for sending the largest number of Hajj and Umrah pilgrims in the world. This is not surprising considering that this Republic has the largest number of Muslims. It is recorded that adherents of Islam in Indonesia have reached 236 million people or 84.35% of the total population. This year, Indonesia is the country that sends the most Hajj pilgrims with 241,000 Hajj pilgrims who will depart. Meanwhile, for Umrah, Indonesia is also one of the countries sending the most pilgrims with a total of 1,368,616 Umrah pilgrims leaving for the holy land throughout 2023. From this number, it is

known that West Java is the province with the most Umrah pilgrims in Indonesia with a total of 247,667 pilgrims, followed by East Java with as many as 228,151 thousand pilgrims, and DKI Jakarta with 210,025 Pilgrimages. Meanwhile, Aceh Province ranks 11th with 30,505 Umrah pilgrims, or 2.23% of the total national Umrah pilgrim departures (Himpuh, 2024).

The large number of Umrah pilgrims creates big problems which are being faced by Umrah service bureaus in Indonesia, and also in Banda Aceh. Currently, Umrah Tourism Service Bureau offers are increasing with the emergence of new companies that present various types of attractive offers, but the operating process is not optimal and does not provide satisfaction value to consumers, so many pilgrims are disappointed with this. It often finds information in the news media about stranded Umrah pilgrims, the escape and disappearance of leaders of Umrah service bureaus, fraudulent departures by offering cheap prices, and so on. Problems with the implementation of the Umrah pilgrimage have also been recorded several times, such as the Pilgrimage failing to leave, service defaults, the Pilgrimage failing to return home, and even administrative sanctions in the form of revocation of PPIU business permits. The Directorate of Special Umrah and Hajj Management of the Ministry of Religion noted that there are at least 29 problems that will arise throughout 2023. There are 10 types of Umrah problems, namely: service defaults in Saudi Arabia, delays in leaving and delays in returning home due to ticket problems, internal problems Organizers of Umrah/PPIU pilgrimage trips (disputes between administrators), disputes between PPIU (buying and selling packages, buying and selling LA), disputes between PPIU and its branches (payment of Umrah fees), non-procedural Umrah by non-PPIU, missing Umrah pilgrims in Saudi Arabia, Umrah pilgrims overstayed their visa limits (overstayers), Umrah pilgrims failed to leave because PPIU had financial constraints, and PPIU opened services outside its domicile area without being equipped with a branch permit (Himpuh, 2024).

The company's standard operational procedures must align closely with the activities conducted in the field to ensure that they are all moving in the same direction. This alignment is crucial as it directly impacts consumer satisfaction. One of the service bureaus that prioritizes consumer satisfaction in Indonesia is Kaifa Tourism Qurani company (mentioned as Kaifa Tourism), in Banda Aceh City. It is one of the Hajj and Umrah service bureaus that prioritizes quality of service, convenience, suitability of costs, comfort, and devotion to the Pilgrimage. It is also one of the largest Umrah service bureaus in Banda Aceh, has also joined the Association of the Indonesian Tours and Travel Agencies (ASITA) and the International Air Transport Association (IATA). Initial survey found it is evident that customers are not very loyal to Kaifa Tourism because the average value is 3.17 ($3.17 < 3.41$). Numerous factors influence customer loyalty, with one being customer satisfaction.

Customer satisfaction has a direct influence on loyalty. The more satisfied customers are with a company, the more loyal they will be. Research conducted by Rahmawaty (2011) and Wardhana (2017) confirms that customer satisfaction has a positive and significant influence on customer loyalty, indicating that customer satisfaction increases loyalty. Additionally, the survey results reveal that customers are not very satisfied with Kaifa Tourism because the average value is 3.30 ($3.30 < 3.41$). Service is a crucial factor influencing customer loyalty and satisfaction. Service is defined as the performance of the service received by the customers themselves and the assessment of the quality of the service they receive (Dharmayanti, 2006: 37). Better service performance provided to customers leads to increased customer loyalty, as customers are more likely to be loyal to a company that offers superior service. The results of research conducted by

Rahmawaty (2011) and Nugroho (2013) show that service performance has a positive and significant influence on customer loyalty, which means that service performance will increase customer loyalty. Customer satisfaction has a significant impact on customer loyalty. Therefore, enhancing service quality (Servqual) to meet customer satisfaction is likely to result in increased loyalty. Putra (2017) has demonstrated that Servqual, directly and indirectly, influences loyalty through satisfaction. Additionally, Lupiyoadi (2013: 91) asserts that genuine customer loyalty is rooted in satisfaction, with Servqual being the primary driver. Customers who are highly satisfied or enjoy the service are more likely to become loyal advocates of the company. Initial survey findings found the Servqual provided by Kaifa Tourism is not yet optimal, as the average rating is 3.21 ($3.21 < 3.41$). This indicates that the service provided is still below par.

2. LITERATURE

Loyalty

Loyalty is a natural inclination that emerges without any form of pressure or influence. Sangadji and Shopiah (2013:104) define loyalty as the behavior exhibited by decision-making units who consistently purchase goods or services from a particular company. This ongoing patronage can result in significant long-term advantages for the company. Tjiptono (2014:393) explains loyalty as a customer's dedication to a brand, store, or supplier, stemming from a deeply positive attitude and demonstrated through regular repeat purchases. Similarly, Hidayat (2009) views loyalty as a customer's dedication to a market based on a positive attitude, as evidenced by consistent repeat purchases. Indicators of loyalty encompass trust, emotional commitment, switching costs, word of mouth recommendations, and cooperation.

Satisfaction

Satisfaction, as defined by Tjiptono (2015:353), is the emotional reaction people have to their experiences with particular products, services, retail stores, or behaviors such as shopping and purchasing, as well as the overall market. This emotional response results from a cognitive assessment that involves comparing perceptions or beliefs about certain objects, actions, or situations with an individual's values, needs, desires, and wants. Satisfaction, as defined by Daryanto and Setyobudi (2014:43), refers to the emotional evaluation of a customer's experience with a product, reflecting whether their expectations and needs have been fulfilled. Kotler & Keller (2016:650) have identified several indicators of satisfaction, which include remaining loyal to a company as long as expectations are met, making repeat purchases, spreading positive word-of-mouth about the company, encouraging others to purchase the company's products, and feeling a sense of responsibility for the company's success.

Service Quality (Servqual)

Service, as defined by Kotler & Keller (2016: 124), is any intangible action or activity offered from one party to another that does not result in ownership. Suit and Almasdi (2012: 88) suggest that optimal customer service entails reliability, speed, empathy, and an attractive appearance. According to Purwani and Wahdiniwati (2017: 65), the Servqual indicators include:

1. Reliability: the ability to provide accurate and dependable service
2. Responsiveness: willingness to assist customers and provide prompt service
3. Assurance: knowledge and politeness of employees to instill trust and confidence

4. Empathy: providing individual attention to customers
5. Tangibles: the physical appearance of facilities and equipment.

3. METHOD

In this study, the target population consists of all customers of Kaifa Tourism. To determine the sample size, the formula of using 10 times the number of indicator variables was applied, resulting in a total of 15 indicators and a sample size of 2150. The sampling method employed in this research was random sampling. Primary data was used, and the Partial Least Square (PLS) method was utilized for testing. Additionally, PLS bootstrapping tests were conducted on both outer and inner structural models. Due to the structural nature of the measurement model and the usage of indicators to measure each construct, the decision was made to employ PLS for this research. The hypotheses tested were :

- H1 : Servqual influencees Satisfaction
- H2 : Servqual influencees Loyalty
- H3 : Satisfaction influencees Loyalty
- H4 : Servqual influencees Loyalty Through Satisfaction

4. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

The Path Coefficient table provided by the SmartPLS output is shown below:

Table 1. Path Coefficient

Variable	Original Sample	Standard Deviation	T- statistics	P-values
X→Y	0.818	0.045	18,337	0,000
X→Z	0.305	0.104	4,774	0,000
Z→Y	0.660	0.098	6,734	0,000

Source: Data processing with PLS, 2023

H1 : Servqual Test On Satisfaction

The first test was conducted to determine whether Servqual influenced Satisfaction. As shown in Table 4.12, the original sample estimate for LS is 0.818 with a significance of less than 5%. The positive original sample estimate value suggests that Servqual positively impacts Satisfaction.

H2 ; Servqual Test On Loyalty

In the fourth test, we examined whether Servqual influenced Loyalty. As shown in Table 4.12, the original sample estimate for LS is 0.305, with a significance level below 5%. The positive original sample estimate suggests that Servqual has a positive impact on Loyalty.

H3 : Satisfaction Test On Loyalty

The fifth test was conducted to determine if satisfaction influenced loyalty. Looking at Table 4.12 above, we observe that the initial sample estimate value for LS is 0.660 with a significance level below 5%. A positive initial sample estimate value suggests that satisfaction positively impacts loyalty performance.

H4 : Servqual Test On Loyalty Through Satisfaction

Testing the mediating effect of the model can be explained as follows.

Table 2. Sobel Test

Input:	Test statistic:	Std. Error:	p-value:
a 0.818	Sobel test: 6.31520373	0.08548893	0
b 0.660	Aroian test: 6.30681784	0.0856026	0
s _a 0.045	Goodman test: 6.32362316	0.08537511	0
s _b 0.098	Reset all	Calculate	

Sobel test calculation provides $Z -6.314 > 1.98$ with $p < 5\%$. This confirms that Satisfaction mediates the Servqual on Loyalty. The mediation is proven as partial mediation, which means that Servqual can affect Loyalty both directly and indirectly (through satisfaction).

Discussion

Servqual Affecting Satisfaction

The finding proves that Servqual positively affects satisfaction. Servqual is a crucial factor that contributes to customer satisfaction and is linked to word-of-mouth behavior such as complaints, recommendations, and exchanges or transfers. Customer satisfaction is an integral part of marketing and plays a significant role in the market. A customer-oriented marketing strategy necessitates understanding customer behavior and meeting customer needs to achieve satisfaction. Servqual aims to create a comfortable experience for customers so that they perceive they are getting more value than expected. Customer expectations are crucial, and Servqual, when aligned with customer satisfaction, can lead to higher expectations, and vice versa (Ayse, 2007:53). In his research, (Gigih, 2019) found that customer satisfaction is significantly and positively influenced by the quality of service provided to customers. Similarly, (Aulia, 2021) found that customer satisfaction levels are achieved through the delivery of excellent service.

Servqual Affecting Loyalty

The results prove that Servqual positively affects Loyalty. Service is the performance of the service received by the customers themselves and assessing the quality of the service they experience (Dharmayanti, 2006: 37). In the meantime, loyalty refers to a customer's commitment to a brand, store, or supplier, based on a very positive attitude and reflected in consistent repeat purchases. Based on the definition above, it can be explained that the performance of the service received by customers will influence loyalty. This is because the better the service performance provided to customers, the more loyal they will be to the company. The results of research conducted by Rahmawaty (2011) and Nugroho (2013) demonstrate that service performance has a positive and significant influence on customer loyalty, which means that service performance will increase customer loyalty.

Satisfaction Affecting Loyalty

The finding reveals that satisfaction positively affects customer loyalty. Tjiptono (2015:353) states

customer satisfaction refers to the emotional response resulting from experiences with specific products or services, retail outlets, and even behavioral patterns within the market. On the other hand, loyalty represents a customer's dedication to a brand, store, or supplier, demonstrated through consistently choosing to make repeat purchases. From the given definitions, it is evident that customer satisfaction influences loyalty. When customers are more satisfied with a company, their loyalty to the company increases. The research results from Rahmawaty (2011) and Wardhana (2017) illustrate that customer satisfaction significantly and positively affects customer loyalty, ultimately leading to increased customer loyalty.

Satisfaction Mediation On Servqual Affecting Loyalty

The Sobel test calculation provided a Z value of -6.315, which is greater than 1.98 with a significance level of 5%. This finding indicates that Satisfaction mediates the influence of Servqual on Loyalty. The mediation results indicate partial mediation. This conclusion was drawn from the significance test in Figure 4.4, where the Servqual variable has a significant effect on Satisfaction and an effect on Loyalty. Similarly, the Satisfaction variable has a significant effect on Loyalty, leading to the conclusion that the Satisfaction variable partially mediates the influence of Servqual on Loyalty. It can be inferred that customer satisfaction has an impact on loyalty, and therefore, developing Servqual to enhance customer satisfaction will ultimately lead to loyalty. Putra (2017) demonstrates that Servqual has both direct and indirect effects on loyalty through satisfaction. Lupiyoadi (2013: 91) also asserts that true loyalty is rooted in customer satisfaction, with Servqual being the main driver. Customers who are highly satisfied or enjoy the service tend to become loyal supporters of the company.

5. CCONCLUSION

This research findings show that in Umrah Travel Product of Kaifa Tourism in Banda Aceh :

- 1) Servqual to Pilgrimage significantly influences Pilgrimage Satisfaction
- 2) Servqual to Pilgrimage significantly influences Pilgrimage Loyalty
- 3) Satisfaction significantly influences Pilgrimage Loyalty in Umrah Travel
- 4) Satisfaction significantly mediates the Servqual to Pilgrimage affecting Pilgrimage Loyalty

Satisfaction with the findings is proven to function as a partial mediator. These findings explain the model of increasing Pilgrimage Loyalty is a function of increasing Servqual in Pilgrimage and Pilgrimage Satisfaction. The results of this study strengthen the theory of causality in its relationship with the current Umrah Pilgrimage. The results can strengthen the theory academically and become the basis for developing further models through further studies. Further studies are suggested to be able to develop a larger scope of variables, indicators, and subjects from this study.

REFERENCES

- Adam, M., Yunus, M., & Iskandar. The Effect of Sharia Trust and Compliance on Consumer Loyalty through Commitment and Customer Intimacy in PT Bank Aceh Sharia, *International Journal of Scientific and Management Research*, 5(3), 165-177
- Adam, M., Ibrahim, M., Ikramuddin, and Syahputra, H. (2020). The Role of Digital Marketing Platforms on Supply Chain Management for Customer Satisfaction and Loyalty in Small

-
- and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in Indonesia. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 9(3), 1210-1220.
- Akhter, W., Abbasi, A.S., Ali, I. & Afzal, H. (2011). Factors influencing customer loyalty in Pakistan. *African Journal of Business Management*, 5(4):1167-1174
- Almasdi & Jusuf, S. (2012). Aspects of Mental Attitude in Human Resources Management. Jakarta: Syiar Media
- Apriyanti, P., Surya, D., & Lutfi. (2017). Analysis of Service Quality and Company Image on Customer Loyalty with Customer Satisfaction as an Intervening Variable. *Tirtayasa Business and Management Research Journal*, 1(2), 159–166
- Aulia, LS (2021). Analysis of Service Quality and Price Perceptions on Customer Satisfaction. *Journal of Social Economics and Politics*, 1(2), 1-6
- Ene, S & Ozkaya, B. (2014). A Study On Corporate Image, Customer Satisfaction, and Brand Loyalty in the Context of Retail Stores. *Asian Social Science*. Marmara University, Istanbul, Turkey
- Ayse, O. L. (2007). An Evaluation of Fast-Food Preferences According to Gender. *Humanity & Social Sciences Journal*, 2(1) 43-50
- Bungin, B. (2006). *Qualitative Research Data Analysis*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo
- Dharmayanti, D. (2006). Analysis of the Impact of Service Performance and Satisfaction as Moderating Variables on Customer Loyalty. *Journal of Marketing Management*. Vol. 1, No. 1.
- Daryanto & Setyobudi, I. (2014). *Customers and Excellent Service*. Malang: Media Style.
- Doyo, P. (2006). *Consumer Behavior and Loyalty*. Andi Publisher, Yogyakarta
- Elizabeth, M. (2018). The Role of Customer Satisfaction on the Influence of Service Performance on Customer Loyalty in. *Journal of Business and Economics*. Vol. 5, no. 2.
- Gigih, N. (2019). The Influence of Service Quality and Price on Customer Satisfaction and the Implications for Customer Loyalty. *Journal of Management*, 07, 47–67.
- Gregory. (2011). The Influence of Company Image, Brand Image and Product Quality on Purchasing Decisions of Samsung Brand Smartphones. *E- Journal of Management Research* 60.
- Hidayat, R. (2009). The Influence of Service Quality, Product Quality, and Customer Value on Bank Mandiri Customer Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty. *Journal of Business and Economics*. Vol. 5.
- Hurriyati, R. (2015). *Marketing Mix and Consumer Loyalty*. Bandung: ALFABETHA
- Irawan, H. (2012). *10 Principles of Customer Satisfaction*. PT Elex Media Komputindo, Jakarta.
- Irwanto. (2021). Analysis of Electricity Bill Calculations in the Community Using the Centralized Meter Recording Application Method, *Journal of Research Innovation*, 2(1), 47-58.
- Cashmere. (2017.) *Excellent Customer Service: Theory and Practice*. PT Raja Grafindo Persada: Jakarta
- Kotler, P & Keller, K. (2016). *Marketing Management*, 15th Edition. Pearson Education, Inc.
- Kotler, P & Keller, K. (2017). *Marketing Management*. Edition 1. Translation: Bob Sabran, MM. Jakarta : Erlangga
- Kuncoro, M. (2013). *Research Methods for Business and Economics*, Edition 4. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Lovelock, C. (2010). *Services Marketing*, Edition 7, Volume 2. Erlangga: Jakarta
- Lupiyoadi, R. (2013). *Services Marketing Management*. Jakarta : Salemba Empat

-
- Maryati, N&Muhidin, A. (2020). The Influence of Company Image and Service Quality on Customer Satisfaction. *Business Management and Entrepreneurship Journal*, 2(2), 104-115.
- Mowen, J & Minor, M. (2002). *Consumer behavior*. Jakarta : Erlangga.
- Nurullaili & Wijayanto. (2013). Analysis of Factors That Influence Tupperware Consumer Loyalty. *Journal of Business Administration*. Volume 2, No. 1
- Nugroho, W. (2013). The Influence of Service Performance, Trust and Satisfaction on Consumer Loyalty. *Journal of Management*. Vol. 2, no. 3.
- Pramudyo (2014). The Influence of Brand Image on Loyalty Through Satisfaction as an Intervening. *JBMA*. Vol I No. 1
- Prayoga, IMS, Yasa, NNK, & Wardana, M. (2015). Relational Benefits, Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty at the PT Honda Dewata Motor Workshop. *Journal of Management and Entrepreneurship*, 17(1), 11–20
- Putra, H. (2017). The Effect of Service Quality on Customer Loyalty through Satisfaction. *Diponegoro Journal of Social and Politics*, 1(1), 1-8
- Rahmawaty, A. (2016). The Influence of Service Performance, Satisfaction, Trust, and Commitment on Loyalty. *African Journal of Business Management*. Vol. 5, no. 1.
- Richard, S & Zhang, H. (2014). Sales promotion and purchasing intention : applying the technology acceptance model in consumer to consumer marketplace. *International Journal of Business, Humanities and technology*, vol.4 no.3
- Robby, D. (2017). The Influence of Service Quality, Trust and Satisfaction on Customer Loyalty at PT. Padang Tour Padang Island Tour. *EKOBISTEK Journal, Faculty of Economics*. Vol. 6, no. 2.
- Sangadji, EM, and Sopiah. (2013). *Consumer Behavior: A Practical Approach Accompanied by: Collection of Research Journals*. Yogyakarta: Andi Publishers.
- Setyobudi, I. (2014). *Customers and Excellent Service*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media
- Sofi, N. (2017). The Influence of E-Commerce Strategy, Service Performance and Satisfaction as Moderating Variables on Loyalty. *Management Research E-Journal*. Vol. 1, No. 2.
- Solomon, R. (2002). *Consumer Behavior: Buying, Having and Being*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Subagyo, A. (2010). *Marketing In Business*. first edition, first printing. Jakarta: Mitra Discourse Media
- Sulaiman., Jasman, J., Honeyta, L., and Yusniar. (2015). The Role Of Brand Love As Mediation Factor Toward Customer Loyalty. *Aceh International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4 (1): 68 - 73
- Sulistiyawati, M & Seminari, K. (2015). The Influence of Service Quality on Customer Satisfaction. *Unudm Management E-Journal* 4(8), 2318-2332
- Sumartini, N & Yulianthini, N. (2021). The Influence of Company Image and Customer Satisfaction on Loyalty. *Journal of Management*, 7(1), 1-10
- Sumarwan, U. (2014). *Consumer Behavior Theory and Its Application in Marketing*, Ghalia Indonesia. Bogor.
- Suratno. (2016). The influence of company image and service quality on customer loyalty with customer satisfaction as an intervening variable at PT Pelabuhan Indonesia Semarang. *Journal of Management*, 2(2)
- Suardi. (2011). *Towards Customer Satisfaction Through Creating Service Quality*. Semarang
-

State Polytechnic

Tjiptono, F. (2015). *Marketing Strategy*, Edition 4. Andi Publisher, Yogyakarta

Tjiptono, F. (2014). *Services Marketing – Principles, Applications, and Research*. Andi Offset, Yogyakarta.

Wardhana, A. (2017). Analysis of Service Performance and Customer Satisfaction on Customer Loyalty. *Management journal*. Vol. 5, no. 1.

Widiyanto, I. (2012). Analysis of the Influence of Brand Image and People on Purchasing Decisions in Cups (coffee & Kitchen). *Journal of Management Economics*. Vol 15 No. 1

Wijayanti, T. (2017). *Marketing Plan in Business Third Edition*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.

Yamit, Z. (2010). *Product & Service Quality Management*, Vol. First Edition. EKONISIA, Yogyakarta

Yudiana, FE, & Setyono, J. (2016). Analysis of Corporate Social Responsibility, Customer Loyalty, Corporate Image and Customer Satisfaction in Sharia Banking. *Inference*,10(1), 93

Yunus, M., Musnadi, S., & Muttalib, A. (2020). The Role Of Mutawwif As A Moderation In Improving The Loyalty Of The Pilgrim: Study In Pt. Al-Mabrur Aceh. *International Journal of Business Management and Economic Review*, 3(2), 30-41

Zulkarnain. (2013). Post-purchase regret in terms of the Big Five Services. *University of North Sumatra*. Vol. 40, no. 1, 81-91